

26)

CONFIDENTIAL

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

Minutes of the meeting of the Departmental Promotion Committee held on 2nd June, 2009 at 1200 hrs. and 3rd June, 2009 at 1100 hrs. in the office of the Union Public Service Commission, Shahjahan Road, New Delhi-110069.

PRESENT:

1. Prof. D. P. Agrawal
Chairman, UPSC. Chairman
2. Shri B.C. Bhardwaj
Insurance Commissioner,
Employees' State Insurance Corporation. Member
3. Shri B.K. Sahu,
Additional Commissioner (P&A),
Employees' State Insurance Corporation. Member

ITEM : DPC – Selection of officers for officiating promotion to the post of Deputy Director (Administration/Training/Insurance) {Group 'A'; Scale of pay: Rs.8,000-13,500 (pre-revised)} in the Employees' State Insurance Corporation.

The Committee considered the question of selection of officers for officiating promotion to the post of Deputy Director (Administration/Training/Insurance) in the Employees' State Insurance Corporation.

2. The vacancy position as stated by the Employees' State Insurance Corporation is as under:

<u>Years</u>	<u>Gen.</u>	<u>SC</u>	<u>ST</u>	<u>Total</u>
2005-06	15	06	06	27
2006-07	02	01	-	03
2007-08	02	02	-	04
2008-09	42	05	04	51

Contd/-

CONFIDENTIAL

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

3. The Departmental Promotion Committee were informed of the following provisions contained in the DPC guidelines, circulated by the Department of Personnel and Training, vide their O.M. No. 22011/5/86-Estt.(D) dated 10.04.1989:-

- (i) "6.1.2. – The DPC enjoy full discretion to devise their own methods and procedures for objective assessment of the suitability of candidates who are to be considered by them".
- (ii) "6.1.3. – While merit has to be recognized and rewarded, advancement in an officer's career should not be regarded as a matter of course, but should be earned by dint of hard work, good conduct and result oriented performance as reflected in the ACRs and based on strict and rigorous selection process".
- (iii) "6.2.1 (b) -- The DPC should assess the suitability of the officers for promotion on the basis of their service record and with particular reference to the CRs for preceding five years, which became available during the year immediately preceding the vacancy/panel year."
- (iv) "6.2.1(e) – The DPC should not be guided merely by the overall grading, if, any, that may be recorded in the CRs but should make its own assessment on the basis of entries in the CRs, because it has been noticed that some times the overall grading in a CR may be inconsistent with the grading under various parameters or attributes".
- (v) "6.2.1(f) - If the Reviewing authority or the Accepting authority as the case may be has overruled the Reporting Officer or the Reviewing authority as the case may be, the remarks of the latter authority should be taken as the final remarks for the purposes of assessment provided it is apparent from the relevant entries that the higher authority has come to a different assessment conclusively after due application of mind. If the remarks of the Reporting Officer, Reviewing authority and Accepting authority are complementary to each other and one does not have the effect of overruling the other, then the remarks should be read together and the final assessment made by the DPC."

Dir 7

Contd/-

CONFIDENTIAL

**UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.**

4. The Committee were also informed that in accordance with the instructions contained in para 6.3.1 of the DOP&T O.M. No. 22011/5/86-Estt(D) dated 10.04.1989, read with subsequent O.M. No. 22011/5/91-Estt(D) dated 27.03.1997 and O.M. No. 35034/7/97-Estt(D) dated 08.02.2002, the bench mark for promotion in the present case is "Good".

5. Attention of the Committee were also invited to the instructions contained in DOP&T O.M. No. 35034/7/97-Estt(D) dated 08.02.2002, which inter-alia provides that "the DPC shall determine the merit of those being assessed for promotion with reference to the prescribed bench mark and accordingly grade the officers as "Fit" or "Unfit" only. Only those who are graded "fit" (i.e. who meet the prescribed bench mark) by the DPC shall be included and arranged in the select panel in order of their inter-se seniority in the feeder grade. Those officers who are graded "unfit" (in terms of the prescribed bench mark) by the DPC shall not be included in the select panel. Thus, there shall be no supersession in promotion among those who are graded "fit" (in terms of the prescribed bench mark) by the DPC".

6. The Committee were apprised that taking into account the instructions/guidelines, issued by DOP&T, as detailed above, the Commission in exercise of their constitutional functions as envisaged in Article 320 of the Constitution took a conscious decision that an officer attaining at least 4 bench mark gradings out of the 5 ACRs, as prescribed by the Government of India in Deptt. of Personnel and Training O.M. No. 22011/9/98-Estt(D) dated 08.09.1998, read with subsequent O.M. of even number dated 16.06.2000, should be assessed as "fit" for promotion and that this decision should be applicable to all DPCs pertaining to the vacancy year 2003-2004 and subsequent years.

7. The Committee were informed that no officers belonging to SC/ST Community were available for consideration against the reserved vacancies even in the extended zone of consideration. As such, the size of zone of consideration for the vacancy years 2005-06, 2006-07 and 2007-08 was restricted in terms of Department of Personnel and Training instructions.

8. The Departmental Promotion Committee, accordingly examined the Character Rolls of the eligible officers, and assessed them as indicated against each in Annexure I.

W/P 7

Contd/-

264


CONFIDENTIAL


UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

9. On the basis of the assessment as given in Annexure-I, the Committee recommend that the yearwise panels for officiating promotion to the post of Deputy Director (Administration/Training/Insurance) in the Employees' State Insurance Corporation should consist of the officers mentioned in Annexure-II in the order stated therein.

10. The Employees' State Insurance Corporation have furnished the requisite integrity certificates in respect of the officers recommended for promotion.

DP 3/6
(D.P. AGRAWAL)


3/6/09
(B.K. SAHU)


3/6/09
(B.C. BHARDWAJ)

285

CONFIDENTIAL
ANNEXURE-I

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.
ASSESSMENT FOR THE YEAR 2005-06 (No. of vacancies Gen.15+SC.6+ST.6 = 27)

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
1.	R. C. Gupta	As in sealed cover
2.	C. P. Sharma	As in sealed cover
3.	M. Maithani	Fit
4.	K. Srikrishnan	As in sealed cover
5.	Om Prakash (SC)	Unfit*
6.	P. V. J. Nambiar	As in sealed cover
7.	Amitabha Sen	Unfit**
8.	T. K. Unnikrishnan	Fit
9.	Surinder Kumar (Maggo)	Fit
10.	G. Kittusamy	Fit
11.	K. S. Murthy	Fit
12.	A. K. Bose	Fit
13.	Suresh Chander(Kaushik)	Fit
14.	T. Divakara Murthy	Fit
15.	Hari Krishan	Fit
16.	Bishwa Nath Singh	Fit
17.	P. M. Shetty	Fit
18.	J. R. Rao	Fit
19.	M. K. Vyas	Fit
20.	V. K. Rawat	Fit
21.	John Mathew	Fit
22.	Subhash Chand Gupta	Unfit
23.	Hitendra Kumar	Fit
24.	S. S. Juneja	Fit

DR/72 ?

Contd...../-

**CONFIDENTIAL
ANNEXURE-I**

**UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.**

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
25.	Surinder Kr. Verma	Not required to be assessed in terms of DOP&T O.M. No.35034/7/97-Estt.(D) dated 8 th February, 2002
26.	P. N. Dharamadhikari	

* Due to penalties imposed vide orders dated 28.02.2006 and 25.06.2007.
** Due to penalties imposed vide orders dated 10.5.2007 and 8.7.2008.

**ASSESSMENT FOR THE YEAR 2006-07 (No. of vacancies-Gen.02 + SC.01 and
06 SC + 06 ST unfilled vacancies of previous year)**

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
1.	R. C. Gupta	As in sealed cover
2.	C. P. Sharma	As in sealed cover
3.	Om Prakash (SC)	Fit
4.	P. V. J. Nambiar	As in sealed cover
5.	Amitabha Sen	Fit
6.	Subhash Chand Gupta	Not required to be assessed in terms of DOP&T O.M. No.35034/7/97-Estt.(D) dated 8 th February, 2002
7.	Surinder Kr. Verma	
8.	P. N. Dharamadhikari	
9.	Ram Sarup Taneja	
10.	Narayan Chandra De	

**ASSESSMENT FOR THE YEAR 2007-08 (No. of vacancies-Gen.02 + SC.02 and
07 SC + 06 ST unfilled vacancies of previous year)**

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
1.	R. C. Gupta	As in sealed cover
2.	C. P. Sharma	As in sealed cover

Datta 7

Contd...../-

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

ASSESSMENT FOR THE YEAR 2007-08

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
3.	P. V. J. Nambiar	As in sealed cover
4.	Subhash Chand Gupta	Unfit
5.	Surinder Kr. Verma	Fit
6.	P. N. Dharamadhikari	As in sealed cover
7.	Ram Sarup Taneja	Fit
8.	Narayan Chandra De	Not required to be assessed in terms of DOP&T O.M. No.35034/7/97-Estt.(D) dated 8 th February, 2002.

ASSESSMENT FOR THE YEAR 2008-09 (No. of vacancies-Gen.42 + SC.05 + 04 ST
and 09 SC + 06 ST unfilled vacancies of previous year)

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
1.	P. V. J. Nambiar	As in sealed cover
2.	P. N. Dharamadhikari	As in sealed cover
3.	Narayan Chandra De	Fit
4.	B. N. Sakhaikar	Fit
5.	S. S. Murthy	Fit
6.	D. K. Chopra	Fit
7.	Ramesh Bahadur	Fit
8.	Naresh Kumar Gupta	Fit
9.	Gulshan Kumar	Fit
10.	Sarwar Alam	Fit
11.	Mohd. Attaullah	Fit

DD 17/2

Contd...../-

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Name (S/Shri/Ms.)</u>	<u>Assessment</u>
12.	B. V. Rajendrudu	Fit
13.	R. K. Patanaik	Fit
14.	S. Krishna Kumar	Fit
15.	Eapen Chacko	Fit
16.	S. Thiyagarajan	Fit
17.	R. S. Mishra	Fit
18.	Aruna Sharma	Fit
19.	D. K. Saha	Fit
20.	V. K. Goel	Fit
21.	P. Tripathy	Fit
22.	B. P. Pandey	Fit
23.	R. K. Mondal	Fit
24.	S. C. Nayak	Fit
25.	N. Anand Kumar	Fit
26.	V. Sarangapani	Fit
27.	Rajesh Kumar	Fit
28.	Mahender Kumar	Fit

DPA 7
3/6
(D.P. AGRAWAL)


(B.K. SAHU)


(B.C. BHARDWAJ)

269

CONFIDENTIAL
ANNEXURE-II

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

PANEL FOR THE YEAR 2005-06

Sl.No. Name (S/Shri/Ms.)

1. M. Maithani
2. T. K. Unnikrishnan
3. Surinder Kumar (Maggo)
4. G. Kittusamy
5. K. S. Murthy
6. A. K. Bose
7. Suresh Chander(Kaushik)
8. T. Divakara Murthy
9. Hari Krishan
10. Bishwa Nath Singh
11. P. M. Shetty
12. J. R. Rao
13. M. K. Vyas
14. V. K. Rawat
15. John Mathew

Extended Panel

- | | |
|-------------------|---|
| 1. Hitendra Kumar | To be operated in lieu of officers in the regular panel |
| 2. S. S. Juneja | at Sl.No.3 and 15 who are not available for promotion
due to their death/Vol. Retirement during the vacancy
year 2005-06. |

PANEL FOR THE YEAR 2006-07

Sl.No. Name (S/Shri/Ms.)

1. Om Prakash (SC) Recommended Against Unreserved Vacancy
2. Amitabha Sen

Dato ?
376

Contd...../-

270

CONFIDENTIAL
ANNEXURE-II

UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

PANEL FOR THE YEAR 2007-08

Sl.No. Name (S/Shri/Ms.)

1. Surinder Kr. Verma
2. Ram Sarup Taneja

PANEL FOR THE YEAR 2008-09

Sl.No. Name (S/Shri/Ms.)

1. Narayan Chandra De
2. B. N. Sakhaikar
3. S. S. Murthy
4. D. K. Chopra
5. Ramesh Bahadur
6. Naresh Kumar Gupta
7. Gulshan Kumar
8. Sarwar Alam
9. Mohd. Attaullah
10. B. V. Rajendrudu
11. R. K. Patanaik
12. S. Krishna Kumar
13. Eapen Chacko
14. S. Thiyagarajan
15. R. S. Mishra
16. Aruna Sharma
17. D. K. Saha
18. V. K. Goel

2008 7

Contd...../-

271

CONFIDENTIAL
ANNEXURE-II


UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION'S FILE No.F.1/39(7)/2008-AP-2
EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE CORPORATION Ref.No. A-33(13)4/2000-E.I.

Sl.No. Name (S/Shri/Ms.)

19. P. Tripathy
20. B. P. Pandey
21. R. K. Mondal
22. S. C. Nayak
23. N. Anand Kumar
24. V. Sarangapani
25. Rajesh Kumar
26. Mahender Kumar

08/12/09
(D.P. AGRAWAL)


3/6/09
(B.K. SAHU)


3/6/09
(B.C. BHARDWAJ)